Comprehensive Instructional Program Review Self-Study Master Rubric

Thank you for participating in this valuable Program Review Process. Please use this rubric as a communication tool between the teams.

GOLD team members – Use this rubric as a guide to complete the Self-Study review, the goal of each section's items is to qualify for the "meets" or "exceeds." If an item does not meet or needs improvement, be forthright and explain why. If an item is not applicable to your program, please state that clearly for each item as Not Applicable (N/A).

Self-Study draft due to Silver Team Captain: 2nd week of November

SILVER AND GREEN TEAMS ONLY HOW DO I USE THE RUBRIC? Each row must have a rubric category box checked or completed box checked, whichever is applicable. Each section must have comments on all "exceeds" "doesn't meet/needs improvement" items that are checked. The rubrics sections/colors/items directly correspond with the Comprehensive Instructional Program Review Self-Study. The Self-Study also contains more detailed instructions to reference.

SILVER team members — The Silver Team Captain (most likely a member of PRC, SLOC, or Research) will be turning in ONE completed rubric to the GOLD Team Captain to represent the entire Silver Team's feedback. How to accomplish the work: 1) The Silver Team members may choose to collaborate and complete the rubric together. 2) Each Silver Team member can complete it individually, and then discuss and compare scores, collaborating on final scores. 3) The Silver Team could also divide the sections among their team members and allow the Silver Team Captain to collate and complete the final scores for final review, discussion, and recommendations.

Silver Team Captain – Completed Rubric due to Gold Team Captain: 2nd week of December

GREEN team members = The Green Team Captain will be working directly with the Program Review Committee (PRC) turning in ONE completed rubric with recommended status (without qualifications, with qualifications, or discontinuance) to the PRC co-chairs Crystal Hilton and Stacey Bartlett. How to accomplish the work: 1) The Green Team members may choose to collaborate and complete the rubric together. 2) Each Green Team member can complete it individually, and then discuss and compare scores, collaborating on final scores. 3) The Green Team could also divide the sections among their team members and allow the Green Team Captain to collate and complete the final scores for final review, discussion, recommendations, and program disposition.

Green Team Captain – Completed Rubric due to PRC: Last week of March

All questions, concerns, or help needed – Please email Crystal Hilton, chilton@shastacollege.edu or her cell phone is 530-227-7281.



Crystal Hilton, chilton@shastacollege.edu and Stacey Bartlett, sbartlett@shastacollege.edu

Comprehensive Instructional Program Review Self-Study – Master Rubric

Section 1 – Background Information

CRITERIA			COMMENTS
Term and year of last CIPR		Check if complete.	This is the program's first CIPR.
	~	Not Applicable	
1. Changes since last CIPR:	~	Check if complete.	SILVER TEAM: We recognize the impressive efforts made in continually assessing
A. Programs			and updating the program. The program's shift from face-to-face to a hybrid
B. Curriculum			model, removing the bottleneck course (ALH 102), and the significant 2023
C. Facilities			restructuring to condense the program into two semesters are commendable.
D. Technologies E. Staffing			The expansion to Tehama is also noteworthy. GREEN TEAM: We recognize and appreciate the impressive efforts in
F. Other changes			continuously assessing and improving the program. Notable enhancements
1. Other changes			include the transition from a face-to-face format to a hybrid model, the removal
			of the ALH 102 bottleneck course, and the emphasis on Credit for Prior Learning
			(CPL) and dual enrollment opportunities. The significant restructuring in 2023 to
			condense the program into two semesters is particularly commendable, as it
			enhances accessibility and efficiency. Additionally, the program's expansion to
			Tehama and its pursuit of CAAHEP accreditation further demonstrate a strong
			commitment to growth and excellence.
2. Summary of Annual Plans	~	Check if complete.	GREEN TEAM: We applaud the program's shift to focus on mastery of entry-level
since last CIPR:			skills rather than high-stakes assessments, focus on developing pathways for
A. Assessment processes and			CPL, high school on ramps, and apprenticeship options for students. We
improvements of student			understand that this is the program's first CIPR; however, we would have
learning B. Student enrollment,			appreciated a more detailed narrative in Part B regarding success, retention,
success, retention, and awards			and completion rates. While the program provided thorough discussions in other areas of this section and has had multiple cohorts complete the program,
C. Diversity, equity, inclusion			further insights into these key metrics would enhance the background and
and accessibility			progress the program has made.
considerations, and outcomes			progress are program has made.
D. Other goals or concerns			
3. Resources received or	~	Check if complete.	SILVER TEAM: Expansion of program resources at the Tehama campus was well
requested		•	documented.
A. Resources received			
B. Resources requested and			
not received			

Year of current review	<	Check if complete.	
List Gold Team Members and Silver and Green Team	V	Check if complete.	
Captains			
Attached Curriculum Map	Y	Check if complete.	SILVER TEAM: The curriculum map looks great. For future growth, we recommend adding a comprehensive assessment plan. The Office of the AVP of Instructional Initiatives will reach out with additional support.
Attached Program Map	>	Check if complete.	SILVER TEAM: No program map was attached but the program page seemed complete. Please verify accuracy. https://www.shastacollege.edu/academics/programs/health-sciences/medical-assisting-certificate/ GREEN TEAM: Program map is attached.

Section 2 – Mission and Learning Outcomes

CRITERIA		DOESN'T MEET		MEETS		EXCEEDS	COMMENTS
1. Alignment with Mission:		Program description		Program description	0	Program description	SILVER TEAM: Good
(Accreditation Standard 1.1, 1.5,		is missing or does		aligns with the Shasta		uses language and	alignment with mission
2.9).		not align with the		College Mission.		examples that directly	
		Shasta College		Includes discussion of		identifies how specific	GREEN TEAM: Recommends
		Mission.		some of the program's		elements of the Shasta	clarification on employment
				successes and benefits		College Missions is	rates.
				to the students and/or		met.	
				community.			
2. Current or recent challenges		Missing or	•	Description is	0	Description is	GREEN TEAM: The challenges
that hinder students from		incomplete, no		somewhat thorough		thorough, relevant and	identified are thoughtful and
reaching their goals		relevant description		and relevant.		uses examples and/or	well-considered,
		provided.				evidence.	demonstrating a clear
							understanding of the
							students' needs and
							experiences.
3. PLOs and Narratives	~	Check if complete.					SILVER TEAM: Excellent
(Accreditation 2.9)							review of PLOs. Analysis
							demonstrated good planning

		and efforts at continuous improvement.
4. CSU/UC Pathway: A. Connect and align with transfer institutions	Missing or not discussed. Connections have been made to connect and align with key transfer institutions. Connections have been made to connect and align with key transfer support, program updates, etc.	NA NA
B. Alignment of program outcomes with transfer institutions	Missing or not discussed. Brief explanation of alignment or rationale for non-alignment. Explanation is thorough.	NA
Program Map Attached (Accreditation Standard 2.5)	Check if complete.	
5. Review program map to ensure alignment with 4-year transfer partners	Check if complete.	NA
6. Review program map to ensure adequate course scheduling	Check if complete.	SILVER TEAM: Ensure website is up to date and attach for Green Team
7. Identify full-time student and part-time student options	Check if complete.	SILVER TEAM: Could a part- time option allow students to work while completing the clinicals to address problems mentioned with "free labor." This may not be an option and typically time is the "enemy" of completion.
8. CTE only: Specify Labor Market Demand (Accreditation Standard 2.2 and Title 5)	Check if complete.	SILVER TEAM: Please update the report with the LMI data for the next version. GREEN TEAM: LMS data was provided.

Section 3 – Instructional Practices

CRITERIA	DOESN'T MEET		MEETS			EXCEEDS	COMMENTS
1. Learning beyond the classroom		Not currently doing	•	Explained general	0	Explanations and	SILVER TEAM: The program
		practice or		learning outside		examples include	effectively incorporates

	1	1	T	1
	incomplete	classroom with	direct programmatic	learning beyond the
	explanation.	example(s).	experiences.	classroom through the
				required 160-hour
				externship in ALH 110. This
				experience provides valuable
				real-world application of
				skills and knowledge
				acquired in the program.
				GREEN TEAM: We agree with
				the Silver Team's
				assessment.
2. Collaboration between this	Not currently doing	Explained general Selection with	Explanations and	SILVER TEAM: The program
program and other areas and	practice or	collaboration with	examples include	demonstrates strong
student services	incomplete	other areas and	direct programmatic	collaboration with various
	explanation.	student services with	collaborations with	student support services,
		example(s).	other areas and	ensuring students receive
			student services.	the necessary guidance and
				assistance. This collaborative
				approach contributes to a
				positive learning
				environment and promotes
				student success.
				GREEN TEAM: We agree with
				the Silver Team's
				assessment.
3. Institutional partnerships with	Not currently doing	Explains one or more	Explains one or more	SILVER TEAM: The program's
other schools, businesses, or	practice or	outside partnerships.	outside partnerships	active participation in
organizations	incomplete	·	with examples and	community events and its
	explanation.		clear benefits to	extensive network of over 30
	·		students.	clinical affiliation sites
				highlight its strong
				community engagement and
				industry partnerships. These
				connections benefit students
				by providing them with
				opportunities for practical
				experience and networking.
				Consider exploring
<u> </u>	1	1	1	

				partnerships with other departments within Shasta College, such as communication, to offer workshops on professional development topics relevant to medical assistants. GREEN TEAM: We agree with the Silver Team's assessment.
4. Efforts to promote engagement among part-time faculty and classified staff	Not currently doing practice or incomplete explanation.	Explains one or more ways the program is doing this.	Explains one or more ways the program is doing this with examples and clear benefits to the program.	
5. Processes and strategies used to establish and maintain academic standards and consistency across sections of the same course taught in varied modalities and by different instructors	Not currently engaged in any practices or incomplete explanation.	Explains one or more ways the program is maintaining academic standards and consistency.	Explains one or more ways the program is maintaining academic standards and consistency with examples and clear benefits to students.	SILVER TEAM: The program's use of standardized course assignments, a common learning management system (LMS), and competency-based assessments in lab classes ensure consistency in content delivery and evaluation across different sections and modalities. GREEN TEAM: We agree with the Silver Team's assessment.
6. Faculty maintain currency in their disciplines and with instructional technologies. With descriptions of how they ensure regular and substantive interaction with students in their online classes (ACCJC Distance	Not currently engaged in any practices or incomplete explanation.	Explains one or more ways the program is doing this.	Explains one or more ways the program is doing this with examples and clear benefits to students	SILVER TEAM: The program faculty's commitment to ongoing professional development, their active engagement with instructional technology resources, and their demonstrated efforts to

Education Policy, Accreditation		maintain regular and
Standard 2.6)		substantive interaction with
		students in online courses
		exemplify best practices in
		online teaching and learning.
		GREEN TEAM: We agree with
		the Silver Team's
		assessment.

Section 4 – Facilities, Equipment, and Technology

CRITERIA	DOESN'T MEET	MEETS	EXCEEDS	COMMENTS
1. Facilities/Equipment needs or updates	Missing or not discussed.	Facilities/equipment updates and needs are explained.	Facilities/equipment updates and needs are explained including impact to student learning, program outcomes, or program	GREEN TEAM: The idea of opening a pro bono patient clinic offering PT services is an excellent goal and would benefit both students and the community.
2. Technology support	Missing or not discussed.	Explained how technology is used and discussion of adequacy of technology for instructional purposes.	growth. Explained how technology is used and discussion of adequacy of technology for instructional purposes including outcomes and relevant examples.	SILVER TEAM: Good integration of technology. GREEN TEAM: We agree with the Silver Team's assessment.

Section 5 – Program Data Analysis (Accreditation Standard 1.3

CRITERIA	DOESN'T MEET	MEETS	EXCEEDS	COMMENTS
Headcount and Enrollment 1. Headcount	Missing or unclear narrative.	Discussed prompt with data table to support.	Thorough detailed discussion of prompt with data support.	SILVER TEAM: The program's headcount data demonstrates a positive trend, with increases from 2019-20. This upward trajectory indicates growing

2. Equity: Headcount distribution	Missing or unclear narrative.	Discussed prompt with data to support. Some discussion about recruitment strategies.	Thorough detailed discussion of prompt with data support. Clearly described proposed actions within department control with timelines and goals.	interest in the program and its relevance to workforce needs. GREEN TEAM: We agree with the Silver Team's assessment. SILVER TEAM: While the program serves a higher percentage of students of color than the overall college population, the significant gender disparity in enrollment, with female students overwhelmingly represented, may be worth some attention. Developing targeted recruitment strategies aimed at male students, particularly those in high school, could help address this imbalance and broaden access to this highdemand career path. GREEN TEAM: We agree with the Silver Team's assessment and encourage the program to continue to target marketing to potential male students.
3. Enrollment	Missing or unclear narrative.	Discussed prompt with data table to support.	Thorough detailed discussion of prompt with data support.	
4. Factors impacting low and highly enrolled sections	Missing or unclear narrative.	Discussed prompt with data table to support.	Thorough detailed discussion of prompt with data support.	
5. Factors impacting program enrollment	Missing or unclear narrative.	Discussed prompt with data table to support.	Thorough detailed discussion of prompt with data support.	

ore : :	na: ·			CDEEN TEANA T
CTE – program outcomes to	Missing or unclear	Discussed prompt with	Thorough detailed	GREEN TEAM: The program
Institutional-set standards for job	narrative.	data table to support.	discussion of prompt	included a memo with data
placement, & hiring percentages			with data support.	about job availability; we did
				not see information about
				placement rates or
				references to Institution-set
				Standards. In the future, we
				would encourage the
				program to leverage Perkins
				data for job placement data.
Retention and Success Rates	Missing or unclear	Summary and analysis	Thorough and detailed	SILVER TEAM: The program
6. Retention Rate	narrative.	provided	analysis provided to	consistently exceeds both
A. 5-year average retention rate			explain the data.	the Institutional Set Standard
				and the college average for
				retention is a remarkable
				achievement. This success
				likely stems from the
				program's cohort-based
				model, supportive learning
				environment, and dedicated
				faculty.
				GREEN TEAM: We agree with
				the Silver Team's
				assessment.
B. Retention rates above the	Missing or unclear	Summary and analysis	Thorough and detailed	GREEN TEAM: The program
college average	narrative.	provided	analysis provided to	used an excellent strategy to
			explain the data.	restructure the curriculum to
				get students into clinical
				skills soon to keep them
				excited and engaged with the
				program.
C. Retention rates below the	Missing or unclear	Summary and analysis	Thorough and detailed	GREEN TEAM: The program
college average	narrative.	provided	analysis provided to	should exercise caution
			explain the data.	when interpreting results
				due to the small sample
				sizes. That said, we
				appreciate the program's
				transparency in outlining the

				reasons for the three student drops; that information provides essential context.
7. Success Rate A. 5-year average success rate	Missing or unclea narrative.	Summary and analysis provided	Thorough and detailed analysis provided to explain the data.	
B. Success rates at or above the Institutional Set Standard	Missing or unclear	Summary and analysis provided	Thorough and detailed analysis provided to explain the data.	SILVER TEAM: All the program courses exceeding the college's aspirational success rate goal of 78.9% is highly commendable. This achievement underscores the effectiveness of the program's instructional design, its focus on student support, and the faculty's commitment to fostering student success GREEN TEAM: We agree with the Silver Team's assessment.
C. Success rates below the Institutional Set Standard	Missing or unclea narrative.	Summary and analysis provided	Thorough and detailed analysis provided to explain the data.	
8. Equity: DI groups for success and retention rates	Missing or unclean narrative.	Proposed actions are informed with data, within departmental control, have identified outcomes, and include some goals.	Thorough discussion. Clear and unique data informed proposed actions, within departmental control, have measurable outcomes, and include short-term timelines and aspirational goals.	SILVER TEAM: While the program acknowledges the disproportionate impact on certain demographic groups, a more detailed action plan is needed. This plan should outline specific strategies for improving outcomes for these students. GREEN TEAM: We agree with the Silver Team's assessment and encourage the program to develop more deliberate

						action plans to address the DI flagged in their program.
9. Factors that impact success and	Missing or unclear		Discussed factors		Thorough and	SILVER TEAM: The program
retention rates	narrative.		impacting student	0	insightful discussion of	attributes its high retention
Teterition rates	Hallative.		success and retention.		factors impacting	and success rates to its
			success and retention.		student success and	cohort-based model, the
						·
					retention.	strong student support
						system, and the dedicated
						faculty who build rapport
						with students and foster a
						sense of community.
						GREEN TEAM: We agree with
						the Silver Team's assessment
						and are now curious about
						the Persistence Project and
						its continued impact on the
						program.
10. Program changes since the	Missing or unclear	•	Discussed changes		Thorough discussion of	SILVER TEAM: This is the
last CIPR to improve success and	narrative.		made to improve		changes made to	program's first CIPR but
retention rates			success and retention		improve success and	evidence suggests a strong
			rates.		retention rates with	commitment to continuous
					examples and	improvement.
					reflection on how they	GREEN TEAM: We agree with
					will adjust strategies	the Silver Team's assessment.
					after reviewing the	
					data.	
11. Additional resources	Missing or unclear	•	Provided a list of		Provided a list of	SILVER TEAM: The program
	narrative.		resources that would		resources explaining	identifies the financial strain
			help students be more		how it would help	of the unpaid clinical
			successful in the		students be more	practicum as a significant
			courses.		successful.	challenge for students.
						Continuing to explore
						creative solutions to alleviate
						this burden, such as
						stipends, scholarships, or
						partnerships with
						organizations offering paid

Program Completion (Accreditation Standard 1.3) 12. Number of degrees and/or certificates awarded	Missing or unclear narrative.	Discussed some observations about the awards conferred.	Thorough discussion of changes in the number of awards conferred with insights to explain changes seen.	internships, would further enhance student success. GREEN TEAM: We agree with the Silver Team's assessment.
13. Equity: Award distribution	Missing or unclear narrative.	Discussed prompt with data to support. Some discussion about strategies to improve equity.	Thorough detailed discussion of prompt with data support. Clearly described proposed actions within department control with timelines and goals.	SILVER TEAM: Consider collaborating with other programs to recruit males into the Health Science programs. GREEN TEAM: We agree with the Silver Team's assessment
14. Median time to degree (Accreditation Standard 2.5)	Missing or unclear narrative.	Discussed prompt with data to support. Some reflection offered about time to degree. Some actions have been identified that could help improve time to degree.	Thorough detailed discussion of prompt with data support. Clearly described proposed actions within department control with timelines and goals.	SILVER TEAM: One semester GREEN TEAM: NA, the program is designed to be completed within one year.
15. Units attempted to complete program (Accreditation Standard 2.5)	Missing or unclear narrative.	Discussed prompt with data to support. Some reflection offered about units accumulated. Some actions have been identified that could help improve the number of units accumulated.	Thorough detailed discussion of prompt with data support. Clearly described proposed actions within department control with timelines and goals.	GREEN TEAM: The certificate is only 24 units to complete. The program was very strategic in its design to ensure students could maximize FA opportunities.

Section 6 - Curriculum

CRITERIA	NA	DOESN'T MEET	MEETS	EXCEEDS	COMMENTS
Review Prerequisites	•	Missing or	Summary and	Thorough and detailed	GREEN TEAM: Applaud the
1. Prerequisites last reviewed and		unclear	analysis	analysis provided to	plans to investigate
assessed		narrative.	provided.	explain the process	advanced placement/CPL
				and any data.	options for this program.
2. Prerequisites preparing	•	Missing or	Summary and	Thorough and detailed	SILVER TEAM: The program's
students for subsequent courses		unclear	analysis	analysis provided.	intentional sequencing of
		narrative.	provided.		courses, with clear
					prerequisite and co-
					requisite requirements,
					ensures students build upon
					their knowledge and skills
					progressively.
					GREEN TEAM: We agree
					with the Silver Team's
					assessment; the course
					sequencing diagram is
					helpful.
3. Challenges to offering key		Missing or	Some challenges	Thorough and detailed	
courses		unclear	are identified. A	explanation of	
		narrative.	list of courses for	challenges provided	
			possible sunset is	with a list of possible	
			provided.	sunset courses.	
4. Course title changes and new		Missing or	o Identified	Thorough and detailed	
courses being considered. PLO		unclear	changes to titles	list of changes with	
Alignment Maps.		narrative.	and suggested	explanations for the	
			possible new	justification of	
			courses. PLO	proposed new	
			alignment map	courses. PLO	
			provided.	alignment map	
				provided.	

Program Design: 5. Unnecessary and/or bottleneck courses		Missing or unclear narrative.	Identified possible bottlenecks or unnecessary courses.	Thorough detailed discussion of prompt with data support. Clearly identified bottlenecks or unnecessary courses with proposed actions, timelines, and goals.	SILVER TEAM: Good plan for monitoring HEOC 11 GREEN TEAM: We agree with the Silver Team's assessment.
6. Stacked certificates/awards		Missing or unclear narrative.	Some discussion was provided about stacked awards.	Thorough detailed discussion of prompt with data support. Clearly identified possible options for stacked awards with proposed actions, timelines, and goals.	SILVER TEAM: The program's consideration of offering two tracks in administrative and clinical medical assisting demonstrates a forward-thinking approach to meeting diverse student and industry needs. Recommend a close review of demand before adding an additional certificate. GREEN TEAM: We agree with the Silver Team's assessment.
7. Course sequencing	•	Missing or unclear narrative.	Some discussion was provided about effective course sequencing.	Thorough detailed discussion of prompt with data support.	

Section 7 – Summary and Future Plans

CRITERIA	DOESN'T MEET		MEETS		EXCEEDS	COMMENTS
1. Changes or improvements	Missing or unclear		Based on analysis from	0	Thorough analysis with	SILVER TEAM: The program
needed	explanation.		this report; changes or		detailed changes or	has outlined several
			improvements for		improvements for the	ambitious goals for the next
			program or curriculum		program or	six years.
			clearly stated.		curriculum. Goals	

	1			
		Identified major goals	identified have	GREEN TEAM: The goals
		for the next six years	strategies to address	identified are ambitious but
		and strategy for	the goal including	incredibly beneficial for
		goal(s).	timeline, budgetary	future students.
			requirements, and	
			persons responsible.	
			Proposed actions are	
			informed by data, have	
			measurable outcomes.	
2. Proposed Actions	Missing or unclear	Provided a list of	Thorough detailed	SILVER TEAM: Several actions
,	Missing or unclear narrative.	actions needed with	discussion of prompt	are planned
		minimal explanation of	with data support.	GREEN TEAM: We appreciate
		timelines or goals.	Clearly described	the timelines and the
			proposed actions	identification of parties
			within department	responsible for each action.
			control with timelines	Some of the activities are
			and goals.	multiyear, but they seem to
			and godis.	be committed to making
				progress.
3. Resource Requests for Annual	Missing or unclear	Clear resource	Thorough description	progress.
Plan	Missing or unclear explanation.	request(s) stated.	Thorough description of planned resources	
T Idil	схріанаціон.	request(s) stated.	that will be requested.	
4. Other information/reflections	Optional. No action n	l eeded on Rubric	that win be requested.	
5. Self-Study Proud Of Item!	· ·	ceded on Rubile.		SILVER TEAM: The Medical
3. Self-Study Frodu Of Items	Check if complete.			Assisting Program Self-Study
				reflects a culture of
				continuous improvement
				and a deep commitment to
				student success. The
				program's responsiveness to
				industry needs, innovative
				teaching practices, and
				dedication to equity and
				inclusion are highly
				commendable. Continued
				efforts in these areas,
				coupled with the

Shasta College	Comprehensive Instructional Program Review Self-Study
	implementation of the ambitious future outlined in the Self-Study, will solidify the program's position as a leader in medical assisting education. GREEN TEAM: We agree with the Silver Team's highlights. The Medical Assistant program did an excellent job with their CIPR.
Additional Notes, Feedback, Comments	